THE UNIVERSITY OF MARYLAND COLLEGE PARK MARYLAND

Daniel R. Vincent Office: Tydings 4128b Phone: 301-405-3485 Email: dvincent@umd.edu ECONOMICS 662

August 27, 2018

Office Hours: Thursday 12:30-1:45.

COURSE OUTLINE AND READING LIST

REQUIRED TEXT:

J. Tirole, *The Theory of Industrial Organization*, Cambridge: MIT Press, 1988. Vives, Xavier. *Oligopoly Pricing: Old Ideas and New Tools.*. MIT Press. 1999.

OTHER USEFUL SOURCES:

Kwoka, John and L. White. *The Antitrust Revolution*. Oxford University Press. 2014.
Fudenberg, D. and J. Tirole. *Game Theory*. MIT Press. 1991.
F.M. Scherer, *Industrial Market Structure and Economic Performance*, 3rd Edition, Houghton Mifflin, 1990.
Gellhorn, E. and W. Kovacic. *Antitrust Law and Economics in a Nutshell*. Fifth Edition, West Group. 2004.

PREREQUISITES: ECON603 and ECON604.

EVALUATION:

Tydings 1108, T-Th: 11-12:30

A number of non-graded problem sets will be distributed for the students to try for themselves. The questions on the exam will be closely based on these problems, so I urge you to understand them as fully as possible. Grades will be based on one final exam (70%) which will be a take home exam given out on the final day of classes and due approximately three days later.

The remaining 30% will be assigned through an antitrust consultant project. I would like you to select a current or recent antitrust case, analyse the economic issues that relate to it and develop *a model* that either supports or defends a side in the case. Here are some recent cases that you might consider:

ATT/Time Warner INC Comcast/Time Warner Cable ATT/DirectTV Burger King/ Tim Horton's Fresh Fields/Wild Oats Google/DoubleClick Oracle/PeopleSoft merger Lepages v. 3M UPM/MacTac merger GE/Honeywell NBC/Comcast USDOJ investigation of Verizon Wireless/SpectrumCo Arrangement ATT/TMobile Merger USDOJ versus Apple (Book publishers and Kindle) XM/Sirius Merger Live Nation/Ticket Master merger US Airways/American Airlines Merger

You may also choose cases from recent news developments.. The emphasis is on model building. I want simple theoretical models that support an economic argument. You are responsible for finding any evidence you need to create a case though I am happy to help to extent possible. Given that information on various cases may be limited, I also am willing to allow some selective evidence creation. I will expand on this as the course proceeds (note: consultant creation of evidence is not a generally recognized best practice). **PLEASE consult with me no later than Thursday, Nov. 8 about your proposed topic.**

Alternatively, students may choose to write a *referee report project*. Each student will select a paper from the syllabus (to be selected with my consent). They will read it carefully and write a referee report on the paper as if it were presented to a journal for publication for the first time. The report should be at least three and no more than five pages. A referee report should

- i) describe the issue and model addressed in the paper;
- ii) explain why the issue is interesting and important;
- iii) provide a critique of the weaknesses and strengths of the paper.

The report is to be typed up and submitted to me electronically. In addition, the student will construct a problem set question along with a solution to the problem that is based on the model in the paper.

1. **TOOLS** (Not covered in lectures)

*Vives, Oligopoly Pricing, Chapter 2.
*Fudenberg, D. and J. Tirole. Game Theory. Chapters 1,3,8.
Tirole: Chapter 11
Kreps and Wilson, ASequential Equilibrium@, Econometrica, 50. Pp. 854-894.
Kreps, D., A Course in Microeconomic Theory, Princeton U.P., 1990. Chapters 11-13.
Debreu, G. Theory of Value, Yale University Press, 1959.
Varian, H. Microeconomic Analysis, Third Edition, W.W. Norton, 1992.

Dixit, A. *Optimization in Economic Theory*, Second Edition, Oxford University Press, 1990.

2 MONOPOLY

2.1 Monopoly: Introduction

http://econ-server.umd.edu/~vincent/lectnotes/ioln1.pdf

*Tirole: Chapter 1.

Nalebuff, Barry. "Competing Against Bundles", in *Incentives, Organization, and Public Economics*, edited by P. Hammond and G. Myles. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000. http://faculty.som.yale.edu/barrynalebuff/CompetingAgainstBundles_Incentives?

http://faculty.som.yale.edu/barrynalebuff/CompetingAgainstBundles_Incentives2 000.pdf

2.2 Monopoly: Price Discrimination

2.2a) General Discussions:

http://econ-server.umd.edu/~vincent/lectnotes/ioln2.pdf

*Tirole: Chapters 2.1, 2.2, 3.

Varian, H., "Price Discrimination", in HIO.

- Mussa, M., and S. Rosen. "Monopoly and Product Quality", *Journal of Economic Theory* 18 2 (1978): 301-317.
- Salop, S., "The Noisy Monopolist: Imperfect Information, Price Dispersion and Price Discrimination", *REStud.* 44 3 (1977): 393-406.
- Katz, M. "The Welfare Effects of Third-Degree Price Discrimination in Intermediate Goods Markets", *American Economic Review* 77, 1, (1987): 154-167.
- Nahata, B., K. Ostaszewski and P. Sahoo . "Direction of price changes in third-degree price discrimination" *American Economic Review* 80 (1990):1254-1258.
- Varian, H. "Price Discrimination and Social Welfare", *American Economic Review* 75,4,(1985): 870-875.
- *Schmalensee, R. "Output and Welfare Implications of Monopolistic Third Degree Price Discrimination" *American Economic Review* 71 1, (1981): 242-247.
- Stole, Lars. "Price Discrimination and Imperfect competition." Draft (2006)
- Schwartz, Marius . "The Perverse Effects of the Robinson-Patman Act", *Antitrust Bulletin*, Fall. 1986.

<u>http://faculty.chicagobooth.edu/lars.stole/papers/pdce.pdf</u> 2.2b) Specific Examples:

http://econ-server.umd.edu/~vincent/lectnotes/ioln2a.pdf Ausubel, L., and R. Deneckere. "Durable Goods Monopoly with Incomplete Information", *REStud.* 59 4 (1992) 795-812. Bulow, J., "Durable-Goods Monopolists", JPE 90,2 (1982): 314-332.

- Conlisk, Gerstner and Sobel, "Cyclic Pricing by a Durable Goods Monopolist", *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 99: 489-505. 1984.
- Fudenberg, D. Levine, and J. Tirole,"Infinite Horizon Models of Bargaining with Incomplete Information", in *Game Theoretic Models of Bargaining*, (A.Roth ed.) pp. 73-98. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1986.
- Gul, F. "Noncooperative Collusion in Durable Goods Oligopoly", *Rand J Econ. 18* (1987): 248-254.
- **Gul, F., H. Sonnenschein, and R. Wilson. "Foundations of Dynamic Monopoly and the Coase Conjecture", *Journal of Economic Theory* 39 1 (1986): 155-190.
- Kolay, S., G. Shaffer and J. Ordover. "All-Units Discounts in Retail Contracts" *Journal* of Economics and Management Strategy, 13 3 (2004).
- *Oi, W., "A Disneyland Dilemma: Two-Part Tariffs for a Mickey Mouse Monopoly", *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 85 1 (1971): 77-96.
- Stokey, N., "Rational Expectations and Durable Goods Pricing, *BellJE* 12,1 (1981): 112-28.

Vincent, Daniel. "Bargaining with common values", *Journal of Economic Theory* 48 1 (1989): 47-62.

2.3 Monopoly: Product Choice and Product Differentiation

2.3a) Product Differentiation:

http://econ-server.umd.edu/~vincent/lectnotes/ioln3.pdf

- *Tirole: Chapters 2.1, 2.2, 3.
- * Caplin, A. and B. Nalebuff, "Aggregation and Imperfect Competition: On the Existence of Equilibrium", *Econometrica*, 59 1 (1991): 25-59.
- Spence, M. "Product Selection, Fixed Costs, and Monopolistic Competition", *ReStud. 43* (1976): 217-235.
- Dixit, A. and J. Stiglitz. "Monopolistic Competition and Optimum Product Diversity", *American Economic Review 67 3* (1977):297-308.

2.3b) Bundling:

http://econ-server.umd.edu/~vincent/lectnotes/ioln4.pdf

Adams, W.J. and J. Yellen, "Commodity Bundling and the Burden of Monopoly", *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 90 (1976): 475-98.

- Bakos, Yannis and Brynjolfsson, E. "Bundling Information Goods: Pricing, profits and Efficiency." *Management Science*, 45 12 (1999).
- *Deskalakis, C., Deckelbaum, A. and C. Tzamos. "Strong Duality for a Multiple-Good Monopolist", (2014), http://arxiv.org/pdf/1409.4150.pdf.
- *Manelli, A. and Daniel R. Vincent. "Optimal Bundling by A Multiproduct Monopolist", Journal of Economic Theory, 127 1 (2006):1-35.
- *Manelli, A. and Daniel R. Vincent. "Multi-Dimensional Mechanism Design: Revenue Maximization and the Multiple-Good Monopolist", *Journal of Economic Theory*, 137 1 (2007):153-185.

Mathewson, F. and R. Winter. "Tying as a Response to Demand Uncertainty", Rand J

Econ. (1997): 566-582.

- *McAfee, R.P., J. McMillan, and M. Whinston. "Multi-product Monopoly, Commodity Bundling and Correlation of Values", *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 104 2 (1989): 371-383.
- Stigler, G. J. "A Note on Block Booking". In G.J. Stigler (ed.) *The Organization of Industries.* Homewood, Ill.: Irwin.

3. OLIGOPOLY

3.1 Classical Oligopoly Theory

http://econ-server.umd.edu/~vincent/lectnotes/ioln5.pdf
*Tirole: Chapter 5
* Vives, *Oligopoly Pricing*, Chapters 4 and 5.
Shapiro, C., "Theories of Oligopoly Behavior", in *HIO*, Section 2.
Novshek, W., "On The Existence of Cournot Equilibrium", *REStud.* 52,1 (1985): 85-98.
Novshek, W., "Cournot Equilibrium with Free Entry", *REStud.* 47 (1980): 473-486.
Kreps, D., and J. Scheinkman. "Quantity Precommitment and Bertrand Competition Yield Cournot Outcomes", *BellJE* 14,2 (1983): 326-337.
Davidson, C., and R. Deneckere. "Long-run Competition in Capacity, Short-run Competition in Price, and the Cournot Model", *Rand J Econ.* 17 3 (1986): 404-415.
Klemperer, P.D., and M. Meyer. "Supply Function Equilibria in Oligopoly Under Uncertainty", *Econometrica* 57 6 (1989): 1243-1277.
Scherer: Chapters 6-7.
Vives, X. "On the Efficiency of Portrand and Cournet Equilibria with Product

Vives, X., "On the Efficiency of Bertrand and Cournot Equilibria with Product Differentiation", *Journal of Economic Theory* 36 1 (1985): 166-175.

3.2 Oligopoly --Horizontal Mergers

http://econ-server.umd.edu/~vincent/lectnotes/ioln6new.pdf

* http://ftc.gov/os/2010/08/100819hmg.pdf

http://www.ipwatchdog.com/2010/08/22/ftc-doj-revise-horizontal-merger-

guidelines/id=12157/ (commentary)

- *Salant, S., Switzer, S. and R.Reynolds. "Losses from Horizontal Merger: The Effects of an Exogenous Change in Industry Structure on Cournot-Nash Equilibrium", *Quarterly Journal of Economics, XCVII 2* (1983): 185-199.
- Porter, R. and M. Perry. "Oligopoly and the incentive for horizontal merger". *American Economic Review* 75 (1985): 219- 227.
- McAfee, RP and M. Williams. "Horizontal mergers and antitrust policy". *Journal of Industrial Economics*. June 1992.

Farrell, J. and C. Shapiro. "Horizontal mergers: An equilibrium analysis". American Economic Review 80 1 (1990.): 107-126. (Plus comment and reply by Werden and Farrell and Shapiro, American Economic Review 81 4 (1991).)

Farrell, J. and C. Shapiro. "Asset Ownership and Market Structure in Oligopoly." Rand J Econ. 21 (1990). Farrell, J. and C. Shapiro. "Antitrust Evaluation of Horizontal Mergers"" *The B.E. Journal of Theoretical Economics* 10, 1 (2010).

http://faculty.haas.berkeley.edu/shapiro/alternative.pdf

- Farrell, J. and C. Shapiro. "Improving Critical Loss Analysis." Antitrust Source (2008).
- Katz, M. and C Shapiro. "Critical Loss, Let's Tell the Whole Story", *Antitrust*, Spring 2003.
- Salinger, M. "The Meaning of 'Upstream' and 'Downstream' and the implications for Modeling Vertical Mergers." *Journal of Industrial Economics XXXVII*, 4 (1989): 373-387.

3.3 Oligopoly – Logit and Multinomial Logit Models of Imperfect Competition

http://econ-server.umd.edu/~vincent/lectnotes/ioln5b.pdf

*Vives: Chapter 6.

- A. Caplin and B. Nalebuff, "Aggregation and Imperfect Competition: On the existence of equilibrium', *Econometrica* 59,1(1991), pp 25-59.
- S. Anderson and A. DePalma, "Mulitproduct Firms: A Nested Logit Approach", Journal of Industrial Economics, XL, no. 3(1992), pp 261-276.
- Konovalov and Z. Sandors, "On Price Equilibrium with Multi-Product Firms", *Economic Theory* 44,2(2010), pp 271-292.

4. DYNAMIC OLIGOPOLY

4.1 Dynamic Oligopoly -- Theory and Framework

http://econ-server.umd.edu/~vincent/lectnotes/ioln7.pdf

*Tirole: Chapters 8,9.

- Bulow, J., J. Geanakoplos, and Klemperer, P., "Multimarket Oligopoly: Strategic Substitutes and Complements", *JPE* 93,3 (1985): 488-511.
- Fudenberg, D., and J. Tirole. "The Fat-cat Effect, the Puppy-dog Ploy, and the Lean and Hungry Look", *American Economic Review* 74 2 (1984): 361-366.

4.2 Dynamic Oligopoly -- Examples

4.2a) General Applications:
*Tirole: Chapters 8,9
Matutes, C., and P. Regibeau. Mix and Match=: Product Compatibility Without Network Externalities", *RJE* 19,2 (1988): 221-234.
4.2b) Bundling as Entry Deterrence:
(% denotes can be found at http://www.econ.umd.edu/~vincent/foreclosure/)

http://econ-server.umd.edu/~vincent/lectnotes/ioln8b.pdf
Carbajo, J. De Meza, D. and D. Seidman.. "A Strategic Motivation for Commodity Bundling". *Journal of Industrial Economics*, 38. (1990): 283-98.%
Director, Aaron and . Levi.. Law and the Future: Trade regulation, *Northwestern University Law Review*, 51 (1956.): 281-96.

- Farrell, Joseph. "A Simple Price-Theory Model of Anti-competitive Exclusive Dealing." Mimeo. 2004%
- Greenlee, P. D. Reitman and D. Sibley. "An Antitrust Analysis of Bundled Loyalty Discounts". USDOJ, EAG 04-13 Discussion Paper. 2004.%
- Kolay, S. G. Shaffer and J. Ordover.. "All-Units Discounts in Retail Contracts" Journal of Economics and Management Strategy, 13,3. 2004.
- Mathewson, F. and R. Winter. "Tying as a Response to Demand Uncertainty", *Rand J Econ.* (1997): 566-582.
- Mills, David E. "Market Share Discounts", University of Virginia, mimeo, 2004.%
- Nalebuff, Barry. "Bundling as an Entry Barrier", *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, CXIX, No. 1. (2004): 159-188.
- Nalebuff, Barry. "Bundling as a way to leverage Monopoly", Yale School of Management, WP #36. 2004.%
- Nalebuff, Barry. "Exclusionary Bundling. Mimeo. 2004?%
- Rasmusen, E. J.Ramseyer, and J Wiley. "Naked Exclusion", *American Economic Review*, 81 5 (1991): 1137-1145.
- Segal, I and M. Whinston, "Naked Exclusion: A Comment". *American Economic Review*, 90 1 (2000).
- Westport Taxi V. Westport Transit District, 664 A.2d (Conn 1995).
- *Whinston, M. "Tying, Foreclosure and Exclusion", *American Economic Review*, 80, no. 4, (1990): 838-859.

4.3 Dynamic Oligopoly -- An Application to Google-Yahoo!

Krishna, K. "Trade Restrictions as a Facilitating Device", *Journal of International Economics*, 1989.

4.4 Dynamic Oligopoly -- Entry, Exit and Predation

4.3a) Theory:

http://econ-server.umd.edu/~vincent/lectnotes/ioln8new.pdf

- Cho, I-K., and D. Kreps. "Signaling Games and Stable Equilibria", *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 102,2 (1987): 179-221.
- Dixit, A., "A Model of Duopoly Suggesting a Theory of Entry Barriers", *BJE* 10,1 (1979): 20-32.
- *Milgrom, P., and J. Roberts. "Limit Pricing and Entry Under Incomplete Information: An Equilibrium Analysis", *Econometrica* 50,2 (1982): 443-459.

Selten, R., "The Chain-store Paradox", Theory and Decision 9 (1978): 127-159.

5. **REPEATED OLIGOPOLY: COLLUSION**

http://econ-server.umd.edu/~vincent/lectnotes/ioln9new.pdf *Tirole: Chapter 6. Shapiro, C., "Theories of Oligopoly Behaviour", in *HIO*, Section 3. Friedman, J., "A Non-cooperative Equilibrium for Supergames", *REStud.* 38,1 (1971): 1-12.

Abreu, D.," On the Theory of Infinitely Repeated Games With Discounting", *Econometrica* 56,2 (1988): 383-396.

Fudenberg, D., and E. Maskin. "The Folk Theorem in Repeated Games with Discounting or with Incomplete Information", *Econometrica* 54,3 (1986): 533-554.

Green, E. J., and R. Porter. "Noncooperative Collusion Under Imperfect Price Information", *Econometrica* 52,1 (1984): 87-100.

Porter, R., "A Study of Cartel Stability: The Joint Executive Committee 1880-1886", *BellJE* 14,2 (1983): 301-314.

6. INDUSTRIAL ORGANIZATION IN COMPETITIVE ECONOMIES

http://econ-server.umd.edu/~vincent/lectnotes/ioln10new.pdf

*Tirole: Introduction

Scherer. Chapter 1, Chapter 3.

Stigler, G. The Organization of Industry, Irwin, 1968.

Dunne, T., M. Roberts and L. Samuelson. "Pattern of Firm Entry and Exit in U.S. Manufacturing Industries", *Rand J Econ.* 19 4 (Winter, 1988): 495-515.

,"The Growth and Failure of U.S. Manufacturing Plants", *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 104 4 (November 1989): 671-698.

**Jovanovic, B., "Selection and the Evolution of Industry", *Econometrica* 50,3 (May 1982): 649-670.

Hopenhayn, H., "Entry, Exit and Firm Dynamics in Long run Equilibrium", *Econometrica* 60,5 (September 1992): 1127-50.

Lucas, R., "On the Size Distribution of Firms", BellJE 9, (1978): 508-523.

7. VERTICAL RESTRAINTS: RAISING RIVALS COSTS

http://econ-server.umd.edu/~vincent/lectnotes/ioln8b.pdf

Rasmusen, E. J.Ramseyer, and J Wiley. "Naked Exclusion", *American Economic Review* 81 5 (1991): 1137-1145.

Segal,I and M. Whinston, "Naked Exclusion: A Comment". *American Economic Review* 90 1 (2000)

Aghion, P. and P. Bolton. "Contracts as Barriers to Entry", *American Economic Review* 77 3 (1987): 388-401.

- Odover, J., Saloner, G. and S. Salop. "Equilibrium Vertical Foreclosure", American Economic Review 80 1 (1990): 127-142.
- Reiffen, D. "Equilibrium Vertical Foreclosure: Comment", *American Economic Review* 82 3 (1992): 694-697.

Mathewson, F and R. Winter. "The Competitive Effects of Vertical Agreements: Comment", *American Economic Review* 77 5 (1987): 1057-1062.

8. MULTILATERAL BARGAINING: "Nash-in-Nash" Analysis

- Collard-Wexler, Alan, Gowrisankaran, G., and R. Lee., "Nash-in-Nash Bargaining: A Micro-foundation for Applied Work", *Working Paper* (2016). Link.
- Chipty, T. and C.M. Snyder. "The Role of Firm Size in Bilateral Bargaining: A Study of the Cable Television Industry", *ReStat.* 81(2) (1999): 326-340.
- Horn, H. and A. Wolinsky. "Bilateral Monopolies and Incentives for Merger", *Rand Journal of Economics.*, 19(3) (1988): 408-419.
- Rogerson, W.P. "Vertical Mergers in the Video Programming and Distribution Industry: The Case of Comcast-NBCU", in *The Antitrust Revolution*, 7th Edition, e. by J. E. Kwoka and L. J. White. Oxford University Press. (2014).

9. ECONOMICS OF TWO-SIDED MARKETS

http://econ-server.umd.edu/~vincent/lectnotes/ioln12.pdf

- Armstrong, Mark. "Competition in Two-Sided Markets", *Rand J Econ.* 37(3) (2006): 539-570.
- Rochet, J.C and Jean Tirole. "Cooperation among competitors: Some economics of payment cards systems", *Rand J. of Econ 33(4)*, (2002): 539-570.
- Rochet, J.C and Jean Tirole. "Two-sided markets: A progress report", *Rand J. of Econ* 37(3), (2006): 645-667.
- Rysman, Marc. "The economics of two-sided markets", *Journal of Econ. Perspectives* 23 (3) (2009): 125-143.
- Schwarz, M. and D. Vincent., "The no-surcharge rule and buyer rebates: Vertical control by a payments network", *Review of Network Econ* 5(1) (2006).

Wright, J. "Optimal payment cards systems", Eur. Econ Review 47,(2003): 587-612.

10. PRICE DISCRIMINATION AND IMPERFECT COMPETITION

http://econ-server.umd.edu/~vincent/lectnotes/ioln11.pdf

- *Armstrong, M. and J. Vickers. "Competitive Nonlinear Pricing and Bundling" *Rand Journal* 77 1, (2010): 30-60.
- *Armstrong, M. and J. Vickers. "Competitive Price Discrimination" *Rand Journal* 32 4, (2001): 579-605.
- Gans, J. and S. King. "Paying for Loyalty: Product Bundling in Oligopoly", *Journal of Industrial Economics*, 54 1, (2006):43-62.
- Stole, Lars. "Price Discrimination and Imperfect competition." Draft (2006)

http://faculty.chicagobooth.edu/lars.stole/papers/pdce.pdf

Thisse, J-F. and X. Vives "On the strategic choice of spatial price policy," *American Economic Review* 78 (1988): 122-137.

11. NETWORK EFFECTS AND COMPATIBILITY

Farrell, J., and G. Saloner. "Installed Base and Compatibility: Innovation, Product Preannouncements, and Predation", *American Economic Review* 76 5 (1986): 940-955.

- Farrell, J., H. Monroe and G. Saloner. "The Vertical Organization of Industry; Systems Competition versus Component Competition.", *JEMS* Vol. 7, no. 2, Summer 1998.
- Farrell, J., and C. Shapiro. "Dynamic Competition with Switching Costs", *Rand J Econ.* 19 1 (1988): 123-137.
- Katz, M., and C. Shapiro. "Network Externalities, Competition, and Compatibility", *American Economic Review* 75 3 (1985): 424-440.
- Klemperer, P., "Markets with Consumer Switching Costs", *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 102,2 (1987): 375-394.
- Klemperer, P., "The Competitiveness of Markets with Switching Costs", *Rand J Econ.* 18, no. 1 (Spring, 1987): 138-150.

____, Price Wars Caused By Switching Costs", REStud. 56,3 (1989): 405-420.

12. RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT

Reingenaum, J., "Dynamic Games of Innovation", *Journal of Economic Theory* (1981): 21-41.

*Tirole: Chapter 10.

Katz, M., and C. Shapiro. "On the Licensing of Innovations", *Rand J Econ.* 16 4 (1985): 504-520.

, "R&D Rivalry with Licensing or Imitation", *American Economic Review* 77 3 (1987): 403-420.

Fudenberg, D., R. Gilbert, J. Stiglitz, and J. Tirole. "Preemption, Leapfrogging and Competition in Patent Races", *European Economic Review* 22 (1983): 3-31.

- Harris, C., and J. Vickers. "Perfect Equilibrium in a Model of a Race", *REStud.*, 52,2 (1985): 193-209.
- Choi, J.P.. "Tying and Innovation: A Dynamic Analysis of Tying Arrangements", Mimeo May, 1998.